The Role of a National Intelligence Estimate in Advancing U.S. Interests and Principles: A Case Study of Human Trafficking in Brazil

by

AUDREY MOONEY

A thesis submitted to the faculty of The University of Mississippi in partial fulfillment of the requirements of the Sally McDonnell Barksdale Honors College.

Sally McDonnell Barksdale Honors College
Trent Lott Public Policy Leadership Institute
Center for Intelligence and Security Studies

UNIVERSITY OF MISSISSIPPI
Oxford, Mississippi
May 2016

Approved by:

____________________
Advisor: Dr. David Rutherford

____________________
Reader: Professor Melissa Graves

____________________
Reader: Dr. Kirsten Dellinger
Acknowledgements

The biggest and most sincere expression of gratitude, without a doubt, goes to Dr. David Rutherford. Your dedication and support to your students is truly admirable and a huge contribution to the Trent Lott Leadership Institute. I would not have been able to get through the thesis process without your guidance, your contributions via your ever-impressive vocabulary, and your much needed humor and laughter.

Next, I would like to extend a big “thank you” to my second and third readers—Professor Melissa Graves and Dr. Kirsten Dellinger. Thank you for not only your time, but also your advice and kind criticism throughout the thesis process. Professor Graves, thank you for your intense help with Chapter 3, specifically. Your knowledge of the Intelligence Community helped bring this product to its audience—the policymaker.

I would also like to thank Dr. Debra Young of the Sally McDonnell Barksdale Honors College. From random and extremely frantic emails throughout senior year, to always being willing to sit down with me and reassure me of my capabilities and graduation date, you were definitely the voice of reason and reassurance.

Finally, I would like to thank my parents. I literally would not be here without them. Your continued support throughout my school years has all led to this! Thank you guys for always being just a phone call away and for always calming me down when I thought the thesis process would consume me. This thesis is dedicated to you :)
Abstract

The purpose of this thesis is to analyze the role National Intelligence Estimates [NIEs] in a current world scenario—human trafficking in Brazil, and the value NIEs add to the Intelligence Community [IC] and US policy makers. The IC uses NIEs as a tool to assess future implications that actions could have on the United States and how those actions can impact U.S. interests. NIEs became prominent when the National Security Act of 1947 was established, which highlighted the need for new and alternative analysis within the IC. This thesis will also investigate how approaches known as Structured Analytic Techniques [SATs] aid in refining analysis. Structured Analytic Techniques [SATs] are a tool to improve intelligence analysis and the judgements made in NIEs. SATs were brought to the attention of the IC through Richards Heuer and Randy Pherson in their 2010 published work, “Structured Analytic Techniques for Intelligence Analysis”.

Throughout this thesis, an overview of SATs, their value added to analysis, and their situational employment will be discussed and analyzed. By using the case study of human trafficking in Brazil, I not only conducted an NIE, but also employed an SAT to help my audience better understand the intelligence process. During my case study in the NIE, human trafficking in multiple forms are investigated—sex trafficking, human smuggling, forced labor, and organ trafficking. The goal of including several different forms of trafficking is to better contextualize the issue of human trafficking and the potential implications it has concerning the United States. Following the NIE, I provide an analytical findings section on the value added by the SAT employed and the NIE product.
# Table of Contents

Acknowledgment.................................................................................................................................................. iii

Abstract................................................................................................................................................................ iv

Table of Contents.................................................................................................................................................... v

List of Acronyms....................................................................................................................................................... vi

List of Figures and Tables........................................................................................................................................... vii

Introduction to Thesis.................................................................................................................................................. 1

Chapter 1: Background on National Intelligence Estimates and the Role They Play in Intelligence Analysis................................................................................................................................. 4
  The Intelligence Community and National Intelligence Estimate
  NIE Case Study: Human Trafficking in Brazil

Chapter 2: Background on Structured Analytic Techniques, Their Value to the Intelligence Process, and the Methodology for Brazil Case Study................................................................. 18
  Background on Structured Analytic Techniques
  Specific SATs and Their Value Added to the Intelligence Process
  SAT Employed and Methodology in Brazil Human Trafficking Case Study

Chapter 3: National Intelligence Estimate: Human Trafficking in Brazil........................................................... 30
  General NIE Background
  Scope Note
  Key Judgements
  Facts and Evidence
  Discussion
  Conclusion

Chapter 4: SAT and Analytical Findings from Case Study................................................................................. 60
  Key Assumptions Check Background
  Overview of Steps
  Overview of Value Added
  SAT Findings and Analysis

Works Cited................................................................................................................................................................. 71
List of Acronyms

• Analysis of Competing Hypotheses...............................[ACH]
• Central Intelligence Agency........................................[CIA]
• Defense Intelligence Agency......................................[DIA]
• Department of Homeland Security..............................[DHS]
• Directorate of Analysis.............................................[DA]
• Drug Enforcement Agency.........................................[DEA]
• Federal Bureau of Investigations...............................[FBI]
• Gross Domestic Product..........................................[GDP]
• Intelligence Community..........................................[IC]
• National Geospatial Intelligence...............................[NGA]
• National Intelligence Council..................................[NIC]
• National Intelligence Estimate.................................[NIE]
• National Intelligence Officers.................................[NIOs]
• National Security Agency........................................[NSA]
• Office of the Director of National Intelligence.............[ODNI]
• Purchasing Power Parity............................................[PPP]
• Structured Analytic Technique..................................[SAT]
• United National Development Programme..................[UNDP]
• United Nations.......................................................[UN]
• United Nations Office of Drugs and Crimes..................[UNODC]
Figures and Tables

Figure 1.1: Hierarchy of NIE Actors................................................................. 6
Figure 1.2: Country Comparison Graph: GDP Per Capita................................ 11
Figure 1.3: Poverty and Inequality in Brazil.................................................... 12
Figure 1.4: Country Comparison Graph: PPP.................................................. 14
Figure 1.5: Brazil Points of Entry................................................................. 16
Figure 1.6: Physical Map of South America.................................................. 17
Figure 2.1: Categories of SATs...................................................................... 25
Figure 3.1: Brazil’s Regions and States........................................................... 54
Figure 3.2: Brazil Points of Entry................................................................. 55
Figure 3.3: Country Comparison Graph: GDP Per Capita............................... 56
Figure 3.4: Country Comparison Graph: PPP................................................ 57
Table 4.1: Key Assumptions Check............................................................... 64
Introduction

This thesis will use a case study of human trafficking in Brazil to illustrate how members of the Intelligence Community [IC] analyze current and future world scenarios to better protect not only US interests and principles domestically, but also abroad. While one may believe an issue in a different continent is not likely to impact the United States, it is actually quite the contrary. Currently, there is a major economic decline occurring in Brazil, and along with this, increased governmental corruption and rapidly rising public disproval with elected officials at a Federal level. The political instability and public outcry is likely to have considerable impacts on US interests within South America—whether that is US personal located in Brazil or the disruption of economic trade flows in the continent.

Brazil is the largest country in South America and has had the most diverse, most powerful economy in the region over the past decade. But in its rise to a global power, Brazil is currently experiencing severe obstacles, and what was once a promising country for foreign relations and investments, is now beginning to look like a quick fall from the top. In the following chapters, the reader will be familiarized with not only a background on the IC, but also tools the IC employs to inform policymakers of potential impacts a situation may have on the United States and future scenarios.

A National Intelligence Estimate [NIE] will be the main intelligence product within this thesis. In Chapter 1, a background of what an NIE entails and its role in the intelligence process will be explained. The NIE is an important intelligence product the IC uses to assess current and
future situations and their impacts on the United States. NIEs are the template used by IC
analysts and are written for “customers”—policy makers, members of Congress, the President, et
cetera.

Following Chapter 1, Chapter 2 brings into focus an important tool that members of the
IC use in their analysis. Known as Structured Analytic Techniques [SATs], these are methods and
techniques used to help refine an analysis and decrease the potential for error. While SATs do not
provide some magic answer at the end of the process, they do help the analyst be conscious of
potential biases and other unconscious “short-cuts” the human mind tends to take. A background
of SATs is presented and their value added to intelligence is explained. With over 50 SATs to
choose from, it is important to understand the reasoning and logic in the decision process of
choosing a specific SAT in the case study. Chapter 2 also contains the methodology used during
the process of conducting the case study SAT.

The actual NIE product written about the case study of human trafficking in Brazil is
presented in Chapter 3 of this thesis. This chapter is formatted differently, in order to reflect that
of an NIE. NIE’s contain their own bibliography, which is included at the end of the chapter. The
purpose of including an NIE conducted on the case study is to illustrate the facilitation NIEs
provide to the IC. The NIE is expected to serve policymakers or other customers requesting the
intelligence analysis and their decisions regarding human trafficking in Brazil. A general
background on NIEs is given at the beginning of the chapter in order to remind the reader of the
NIE writing style and what to expect from the product.

In Chapter 4, a specific SAT is presented that and developed that reflects the assumptions
and analysis made in the case study of human trafficking in Brazil. The SAT employed is the Key
Assumptions Check. Based off the methodology and the overall SAT background provided in previous chapters, this chapter will go on to establish analytical findings and evaluate the value added from the SAT. Not only will the SAT findings be evaluated, the use of the NIE will also be analyzed in this chapter. This assessment of the effectiveness of the SAT and NIE will be followed by a conclusion which brings all previous chapters together. It also serves as a reflection on the thesis process.
Chapter 1

Background on National Intelligence Estimates and the Role They Play in Intelligence Analysis

The Intelligence Community and National Intelligence Estimate:

The Intelligence Community [IC] consists of 17 federal intelligence agencies that work together in protecting America’s interests and national security, both foreign and abroad.¹ Their work is facilitated by the production of research reports known as National Intelligence Estimates [NIE]. Each NIE “represents the U.S. intelligence community’s most authoritative and coordinated written assessment of a specific national-security issue” ("National Intelligence Estimates"). The IC uses NIEs as a tool to assess future implications that actions could have on the United States and how those actions can impact U.S. interests. NIEs became prominent when the National Security Act of 1947 was established.² NIEs are intelligence findings that are produced by a group composed of representatives from intelligence agencies, non-governmental agencies, and experts in academia in order to collate and present the opinions, views, and

---

¹ The members of the Intelligence Community as are follows: Office of the Director of National Intelligence [ODNI], Federal Bureau of Investigations [FBI], Central Intelligence Agency [CIA], Defense Intelligence Agency [DIA], Department of Energy, National Reconnaissance Office, National Geospatial Intelligence [NGA], National Security Agency [NSA], Department of Homeland Security [DHS], U.S. Department of State, Department of the Treasury, Drug Enforcement Agency [DEA], U.S. Air Force, U.S. Navy, U.S. Coast Guard, U.S. Marine Corp (“Intelligence Community”).

² The National Security Act of 1947 was primarily established to combat future intelligence failures in response to North Korea’s surprise military invasion of South Korea.
judgments each agency possesses. This group is known as the National Intelligence Officers\(^3\) [NIOs] and consists of 13 representatives from government agencies and non-governmental agencies ("National Intelligence Estimates").

The NIOs report directly to the National Intelligence Council [NIC], which then in turn reports to the Office of the Director of National Intelligence [ODNI]\(^4\). The NIE process generally starts when a policy maker requests the IC perform an NIE, but can also be requested by the NIC directly. These intelligence products are produced on specified time frames: according to the Council on Foreign Relations, “[t]he July 2004 Senate report describes three rough time frames for drafting: a “fast track” of two to three weeks, a “normal track” of four to eight weeks, and a “long track” of two months or more (“National Intelligence Estimates”).

---

\(^3\) Tasks of the National Intelligence Officers include the following:
- Advising the DCI on their areas of expertise; Producing estimative products;
- Interacting regularly with and supporting senior consumers of intelligence;
- Engaging with outside experts and centers of information;
- Supporting the DCI, the Deputy DCI (DDCI), the DDCI for Community Management, the ADCI for Analysis and Production, the ADCI for Collection and the ADCI for Military Support in the performance of their Community management responsibilities;
- Promoting close collaboration among IC analytic producers on strategic warning and other issues;
- Articulating substantive priorities to guide intelligence collection, production, evaluation, and procurement; and, Overseeing the activities of selected DCI advisory panels and collaborating with DCI production committees under NIC cognizance” ("Director of Central Intelligence Directive 2/2").

\(^4\) See Figure 1.1 for an illustration of the hierarchy discussed in this section.
Once approved, the first step is perhaps the most vital in the NIE process. The NIC puts together the main focus of the issue needing to be answered and the key questions the customer wants answered\(^5\). These questions provide an outline and guide for the National Intelligence Officers to follow when producing the NIE. After answering the key questions and providing the analysis for the issue, several revisions and approvals are made by the NIC and other agency specialists (Rosenbach). After the revisions, edits, and a final approval by the ODNI, the NIE is sent to the President, senior policymakers, and other customers requesting the NIE.\(^6\)

\(^5\) The term “customer” refers to the policymaker or organization that requested an NIE to be performed. This is a common term in the Intelligence Community.

\(^6\) Following is a link to the Officer of Director of National Intelligence and the recent NIC publications (NIEs): [http://www.dni.gov/index.php/about/organization/national-intelligence-council-nic-publications ("National Intelligence Council")].
The format of an NIE is slightly different than that of traditional written products of research as found in academic journals and news magazines, etc. NIEs employ estimative language, rather than definite and exact language. It is used due to the fact that NIEs focus on futuristic analysis and predicting the future with a 100% confidence level is not possible. NIEs consist of a scope note, key judgments, facts/evidence, and a discussion. While this format is altered slightly depending on the NIE’s intended customer, the IC tends to stick to this format in order to have a common variable understood by all intelligence agencies.

The scope note of an NIE is where the National Intelligence Officers outline the direction of the NIE product. In this section, the Officers detail the topic that will be addressed and why. They also detail any reasoning they had for the methods they undertook during their analysis. Also within this section, are the key questions (provided by the NIC) that will be answered throughout the product. Typically, there are only three to five key questions being asked due to the intense analysis and research required to properly address each question. Within this section, as well, the Officers inform the readers where they got their information/intelligence; whether via open source or close source methods. Depending on the clearance levels of the customers requesting the NIE, different levels of information can be included in the NIE.

Following the scope note, come the key judgments. Key judgments take the key questions provided by the NIC and put an estimative assessment on them. Each individual NIE

---

7 As the great Yogi Berra said, “It's tough to make predictions, especially about the future” ("Yogi Berra Quotes...").

8 “Open Source” information can be defined as, “a broad array of information and sources that are generally available, including information obtained from the media (newspapers, radio, television, etc.), professional and academic records (papers, conferences, professional associations, etc.), and public data (government reports, demographics, hearings, speeches, etc.). “Closed Source” can be defined as, “those with restricted access, eg, police crime recording systems and information available through information sharing agreements (ISAs) with partners ("INTellingence: Open Source Intelligence").
has the same number of key questions and key judgments. The key judgment section is where the customer of the product gets a summarized assessment of the agencies’ answers to each question. This section is specifically important to the overall NIE product because it further defines the direction the intelligence product will go. In this section, the Officers provide levels of confidence on what they believe will be the answers to the questions provided by the NIC. These confidence levels are “low confidence”, “moderate confidence”, and “high confidence”. After the key judgment is given, in a sentence or two, the Officers provide a paragraph about what led them to this judgment. These judgments are further analyzed later in the “Discussion” section of the NIE.

After the key judgments, the Officers include a section of facts and evidence. This section is important to include because it provides the customer with the context and reasoning for the assessments made in the judgments. The facts/evidence section usually gives a general background of the topic being analyzed, as well. This is done to make sure the reader of the NIE is properly educated on the subject and can better follow the analysis later in the NIE. It is important to include this section, as well, because it aids the Officers in their analysis by laying out all the facts and evidence. If an NIE is using primarily open-source information, the Officers can be overwhelmed with the extremely high volume of information available to them. By assessing the importance each piece of evidence and fact possess, the analysis conducted by the Officers is strengthened.

Finally, the discussion section of the NIE is where the bulk of the Officers’ analysis is given. This section includes information from the previous sections, but also provides the Officers’ assessment and futuristic analysis. Within this section, the Officers include potential
implications, consequences, and outcomes certain actions are likely to produce. It is important to identify the “so what?” in this section. The “so what?” in an NIE is the value-added to the Intelligence Community and its customers. It also makes the connection the product has to the United States. An NIE should always pertain to the U.S. regarding issues of national security. An NIE does not advise policy making, but rather, informs policy makers of potential re-actions, consequences, and severity of a future event/policy is likely to have.

**NIE Case Study: Human Trafficking in Brazil**

In this thesis, I chose to write an NIE on a case study of human trafficking within Brazil. An NIE is an ideal format for my intelligence product because my audience, or customer, is the U.S. State Department. Being a member of the Intelligence Community, the U.S State Department receives its intelligence reports through NIEs. This product will include my rationale for choosing my specific topic. Since the U.S. State Department is my customer, this NIE will focus on U.S. direct interest in the matter of human trafficking in Brazil, and a broader influence it could have on South America. It will also focus on the U.S. State Department’s desire to promote freedom throughout the world, eliminate global human rights violations, and create a more prosperous world for all. ¹⁹

An NIE is the format I chose to write this product in, as well, because of the topic I will be discussing. According to the U.S. State Department’s Office to Monitor and Combat

---

¹⁹ The U.S. State Department’s official mission statement is as follows, “The Department's mission is to shape and sustain a peaceful, prosperous, just, and democratic world and foster conditions for stability and progress for the benefit of the American people and people everywhere. This mission is shared with the USAID, ensuring we have a common path forward in partnership as we invest in the shared security and prosperity that will ultimately better prepare us for the challenges of tomorrow” (“Mission”).
Trafficking in Persons, human trafficking is one of the top national security threats the world faces today and is likely to face in the next decade ("Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons"). Human trafficking helps fuel and assist organized crime, undermines governmental rule, increases health risks, and violates human rights on a daily basis. On an international spectrum, the United Nations [UN] has declared there is a “challenge for all countries, rich and poor, to target the criminals who exploit desperate people and to protect and assist victims of trafficking and smuggled migrants, many of whom endure unimaginable hardships in their bid for a better life” ("UNODC on Human Trafficking and Human Smuggling"). Being a threat on both national and global scales, human trafficking has situated itself alongside other major national security issues in the 21st century.

Human trafficking in Brazil is especially important to note due to the fact that Brazil is the largest economy in South America, with a Gross Domestic Product [GDP] per capita of around 11,200 USD annually ("Brazil Economy - GDP, Inflation, CPI and Interest Rate"). The fact that Brazil is the largest economy is South America means that it attracts trafficking offenders in the region to establish the industry within Brazil’s borders. Compared to the four main human trafficking countries in South America, Brazil has the second highest GDP, behind Argentina at 14, 700 USD.¹⁰

The other two ranking countries are Colombia and Bolivia, which have the lowest GDPs per capita, with 7,830 USD and 2,860 USD, respectively ("List of South American Countries by GDP per Capita")¹¹. These statistics are important to note because they highlight the incredibly


¹¹ See Figure 1.2 for a representation of these statistics
low annual income per household. This will be further explained in my intelligence product, but it is worth noting that many victims of human trafficking are taken advantage of not only because of their lack of knowledge, but importantly economic stature. By having such of their lack of knowledge, but importantly economic stature. By having such of their lack of knowledge, but importantly economic stature.)

**Figure 1.2: Country Comparison Graph: GDP Per Capita**

Source: "Country Comparison GDP - per Capita (PPP)

![Country Comparison Graph: GDP Per Capita](image)

---

12 See Figure 1.3 for a visual illustration of the income inequality and poverty rate.
By having such low GDPs per capita, this region is an easy target for victim manipulation. In fact, in 2010 the United National Development Programme [UNDP] put together a study that showed the top 15 countries with the worst income inequality (Rubel). Six of the fifteen countries listed are located in South America. Bolivia received the worst score with an income inequality rating of 60 out of 100 in terms of inequality. Out of the top 15 worst income inequality countries, Brazil was 8th, Colombia was 10th, and Chile was 14th (Rubel).

**Figure 1.3: Poverty and Inequality in Brazil Graph**

(“Brazil”).

While Brazil seems to fall towards the middle of these rankings in comparison to surrounding countries, Brazil has the fastest growing and most powerful economy in the region. This characteristic provides potential offenders a more stable country to infiltrate and establish their business. This is illustrated by comparing GDP Purchasing Power Parity [PPP] because it
eliminates the spurious exchange rate variability. I chose to include PPP due to its ability to illustrate a more balanced comparison field when comparing the four countries previously mentioned. PPP also better contextualized the power on the global scale of each economy. Brazil has the highest PPP with a total of 2,416 billion USD. In order to properly analyze the issue at hand within Brazil’s borders, it is important to evaluate neighboring countries’ policies and regulations. In terms of PPP, Brazil is followed by Argentina at 771 billion USD, Colombia at 527 billion USD, Peru at 344 billion USD, and Bolivia at 59 billion USD ("GDP by Country - Thematic Map - South America”).

In spite of its larger economy, a recent decline in Brazil’s economy is another factor of concern (Biller). With the decline beginning relatively recent in late 2014 to early 2015, there is high potential for an overflow of human trafficking from Brazil to other South American countries where economies are more stable. What once attracted human trafficking offenders to Brazil, its increasing economy and global power reputation, is quickly diminishing. Traffickers are likely to see the decline in Brazil’s economy as a threat to their business security and seek other South American countries to establish their business.

13 The International Monetary Fund states the advantage of calculating PPP is its ability to find, “the rate at which the currency of one country would have to be converted into that of another country to buy the same amount of goods and services in each country” (Callen).

14 See Figure 1.4 for an illustration of these numbers.
This is of special concern to the U.S. due to the fact the overflow is likely to increase civil and political unrest throughout the entire region and compromise the trade U.S. has established with countries within this region. Currently, “U.S. goods and private services trade with Brazil totaled $107 billion in 2012 (latest data available). Exports from the United States totaled $68 billion; while imports totaled $39 billion, making the U.S. goods and services trade surplus with Brazil $29 billion in 2012” ("Brazil | United States Trade Representative"). The U.S. was Brazil’s 7th largest exporter in 2013, as well, with the “top export categories (2-digit HS) in 2013 as: Machinery ($7.3 billion), Mineral Fuel ($6.5 billion), Aircraft ($5.3 billion),

15 Here is a link to Office of the United States Trade Representative’s page elaborating on the trade partnership between U.S. and Brazil: https://ustr.gov/countries-regions/americas/brazil
Electrical Machinery ($5.2 billion), and Organic Chemicals ($2.3 billion)

The economy is not the only characteristic of Brazil that catches the attention of human traffickers. The geographic landscape of Brazil not only offers unique advantages to itself, its allies, but also traffickers. Brazil’s land border is approximately 15,700 kilometers long, with shared borders to 10 out of the 12 countries in South America ("Leading the Fight against Human Trafficking in Brazil"). While this provides Brazil with the conveniency to interact, trade, and travel through almost all of South America, it does present a threat to the permeability of Brazil’s borders. This is especially true in relation to borders delineated by sea and water bodies.

For example, the Guaporé river border between Bolivia and Brazil alone there is over 2,100 miles with a port every 100 meters (Forero). Brazil occupies “half the continent’s landmass. It is the fifth largest country in the world, exceeded in size only by Russia, Canada, China, and the United States, though its area is greater than that of the 48 conterminous U.S. states. Brazil faces the Atlantic Ocean along 4,600 miles (7,400 km) of coastline and shares more than 9,750 miles (15,700 km) of inland borders with every South American country except Chile and Ecuador” (James).

---

\[16\] See Figure 1.5
With such a large surface area, Brazil has the largest population in South America, as well, with a total of 200 million people\(^\text{17}\). Along with a surplus of people, Brazil’s climate is one that is diverse, as well. The Southern region of Brazil is typically labeled as being a “Tropical Savanna” climate\(^\text{18}\), while the Northern region is primarily “Tropical Wet with No Dry Season”. “The Equatorial Zones of high temperatures and rainfall provide conditions for the rapid growth

\(^\text{17}\) This estimate is from 2013 (“Brazil Population (LIVE)”).

\(^\text{18}\) Tropical Savannas “can be almost treeless grasslands or denser woodlands – as long as the canopy cover of the trees is not so dense that it shades out the grass (“Frequently Asked Questions”).
of vegetation. For example, in the rainforests on the Amazon, annual rainfall ranges from 1.5 to 2 meters” (Marston, et al). The Trade Winds are responsible for bringing rain to the Eastern coast of Brazil, as well. The Brazilian Highland provide Brazil and its economy with “world-class iron deposits” along the southern edge. Along with rich iron deposits, Brazil is also home to one of South America’s largest coal reserve (Marston, et al). These natural and mineral resources fuel Brazil’s economy and increase the need for cheap manual labor. This directly flows into the growing human trafficking industry.

**Figure 1.6: Physical Map of South America**
"South America Physical Map."

---

19 The Amazon Basin covers an area of 7 million square kilometers (or 1.7 billion acres), in Brazil, alone (“BRAZIL”).

20 Trade Winds occur when Earth spins, and it “drags air flowing from the tropics to the Equator into an east-west flow (Marston, et al).

21 See Figure 1.6
Chapter 2

Background on Structured Analytic Techniques, Their Value to the Intelligence Process, and the Methodology for Brazil Case Study

**Background on Structured Analytic Techniques:**

Structured Analytic Techniques [SATs] are a tool to refine intelligence analysis and the judgements made in NIEs. SATs were brought to the attention of the Intelligence Community through Richards Heuer and Randy Pherson in their 2010 published work, “Structured Analytic Techniques for Intelligence Analysis”. SATs were originally brainstormed by former Central Intelligence Agency [CIA] veteran, Richards Heuer. Heuer spent 24 years in the CIA as the Director of Operations. After his 24 years of service in this position, he moved to Directorate of Intelligence in 1975. Heuer went on to serve in this position for four more years; retiring in 1979. Once retired, Heuer continued working for the Intelligence Community and government through private contracting and advising.

During this time, Heuer became more focused on cognitive psychology and the works of Daniel Kahneman. From here, Heuer wrote his own book, “Psychology of Intelligence Analysis” in 1999. This publication focused on the shortcomings of the human brain when it comes to
intelligence analysis and the cognitive biases analyst face daily\textsuperscript{22}. One of Heuer’s most notable achievements is his development of the Analysis of Competing Hypotheses [ACH], which will be later discussed in this chapter.

Randy Pherson is currently the President of Pherson Associates, LLC, which is a company that teaches “analytical tools and techniques to analysts throughout the Intelligence Community and the private sector” (Heuer). Pherson is known for his efforts in creating a software to support Heuer’s ACH technique and his teachings at the CIA’s Sherman Kent School\textsuperscript{23}. During his 28 year-career with the Intelligence Community, Pherson served as the National Intelligence Officer for Latin America, conducted production of analysis for the CIA regarding Africa, Iran, and Cuba, and served on the Inspector General’s staff (Heuer).

“Structured Analytic Techniques for Intelligence Analysis”, co-authored by Heuer and Pherson, brought a new wave of thinking to the Intelligence Community. After the investigative commissions post 9/11 attacks and the “erroneous 2002 National Intelligence Estimate on Iraq’s weapons of mass destruction clearly documented the need for a new approach to intelligence analysis” (Heuer). The term that seemed to shine through during this dark time for the

\textsuperscript{22} Some of these cognitive biases include “Confirmation Bias”, “Group Think”, or “Anchoring Bias”. Confirmation Bias is described as being “the often unconscious act of referencing only those perspectives that fuel our pre-existing views, while at the same time ignoring or dismissing opinions”. Group Think is the act of supporting an idea presented in a group due to the desire to appease the overall audience. Anchoring Bias can be described as, “the tendency [one] has to compare and contrast only a limited set of items. It's called the anchoring effect because we tend to fixate on a value or number that in turn gets compared to everything else” (Lebowitz).

\textsuperscript{23} According to the Offices of the CIA, the “Sherman Kent School for Intelligence Analysis provides DA [Directorate of Analysis] officers with an integrated, career-long program that combines specialized training in the craft of intelligence analysis with a substantive curriculum interwoven with the values, traditions, and history of the CIA. Courses on the intelligence profession along with instruction in foreign languages, regional studies, and core substantive issues enable DA officers to work in cross-component teams and to stay abreast of global and technological change. Leadership courses help officers explore and enhance their individual abilities and underscore the critical linkage between leadership, values, and the intelligence profession” (“Training Resources”).
Intelligence Community in the term “alternative analysis”. In a book review written by the Air and Space Power Academic Journal, Lt Col Stephen Price of the United States Air Force accurately summarizes the overall theme of the publication:

“[a]lthough Heuer and Pherson do walk the reader through the eight phases of analytical thought, it is not a checklist that one must follow rigidly from start to finish. Rather, this book serves as a guide through the process, providing analysts a number of different options they can employ at their discretion to improve their end product. For each phase of the analytical process, analysts will find a number of valuable techniques that will allow them to conduct multiple approaches to each problem set, either individually or with the assistance of other analysts” (Price).

The theories and findings presented by Heuer and Pherson are the definitive works regarding SATs. These SATs and their characteristics are further described throughout this chapter to better equip my readers with the needed background and processes each SAT entail.

**Specific SATs and Their Value Added to the Intelligence Process:**

The thinking process put forward by Heuer and Pherson in “Structured Analytic Techniques for Intelligence Analysis” is illustrated through 50 different SATs. In order to better assist the analyst in determining which SAT to use for a specific scenario, the authors categorize the 50 SATs in eight sections—“Decomposition and Visualization”, “Idea Generation”,

---

24 “Alternative Analysis” refers to techniques for questioning conventional wisdom by identifying and analyzing alternative explanations and outcomes (Heuer).


26 These SATs include: “Structured Brainstorming”, “Virtual Brainstorming”, “Nominal Group Technique”, “Starbursting”, “Cross-Impact Matrix”, “Morphological Analysis”, and “Quadrant Crunching” (Heuer).
“Scenarios and Indicator\textsuperscript{27}, “Hypothesis Generation and Testing\textsuperscript{28}, “Assessment of Cause and Effect\textsuperscript{29}, “ Challenge Analysis\textsuperscript{30}, “Conflict Management\textsuperscript{31}, and “Decision Support\textsuperscript{32}” (Heuer).

According to Heuer and Pherson, SATs within the “Decomposition and Visualization” chapter are ones that aid in analyst is getting the thoughts out of their head and onto paper. Decomposition—“breaking down the problem or issue into its component parts so that each part can be considered separately” and visualization—“placing all the parts on paper or on a computer screen in some organized manner designed to fascinate understanding how the various parts interrelate” are core processes intelligence analyst undergo (Heuer). An intelligence analyst is constantly given more information than one can physically decipher through. With that being said, it is important that the analyst has the ability to present data in organized ways; that ability is strengthened through the use of the SATs in this chapter.

The “Idea Generation” chapter focuses on creating new and sometimes contradictory theories about a scenario. The SATs in this chapter are generally employed early on in the intelligence process in order to create an accurate scope of the future analysis. An important characteristic of these specific SATs is that Heuer and Pherson recommend analyst conduct these

\textsuperscript{27} SATs in this category are: “Scenarios Analysis—Simple Scenarios, Alternative Future Analysis, Multiple Scenarios Generation”, “Indicators”, and “Indicators Validator” (Heuer).

\textsuperscript{28} The SATs belonging to this section are: “Hypothesis Generation—Simple Hypothesis, Multiple Hypothesis Generator, Quadrant Hypothesis Generation”, “Diagnostic Reasoning”, “Analysis of Competing Hypothesis”, “Argument Mapping”, and “Deception Detection” (Heuer).

\textsuperscript{29} These SATs include: “Key Assumptions Check”, “Structure Analogies”, “Role Playing”, “Red Hat Analysis”, “Outside-In Thinking”, “Policy Outcomes Forecasting Model”, and “Prediction Markets” (Heuer).


\textsuperscript{31} The SATs in this category are: “Adversial Collaboration” and “Structured Debate” (Heuer).

\textsuperscript{32} SATs in this section are: “Complexity Manager”, “Decision Matrix”, “Force Field Analysis”, “Pros-Cons-Faults-Fixes”, and “SWOT Analysis” (Heuer).
SATs in groups. The ability for others to bring their ideas into the scope is likely to strengthen the future analysis. According to the authors, “this structured process helps identify differences in perspective and different assumptions among team or group members, and thus stimulates learning and new ideas” (Heuer).

“Scenarios and Indicators” SATs aid in the extremely difficult process of assessing and predicting the future. Analysts often deal with fragmented or even incorrect information, and these SATs help fill those gaps. These SATs help the analyst broaden their imagination on potential future scenarios. By doing this, the analyst is likely to be more prepared for any “Black Swans”33. These SATs also use degrees of likelihood for the analyst to inspect—“least likely, highly likely, most likely, etc”. Not only do these SATs help the analyst see the severity of each scenario, but they also aid in examining assumptions. Heuer and Pherson state another positive attribute of these SATs by stating, “they provide an efficient mechanism for communicating complex ideas. A scenario is a set of complex ideas that can be described with a short label” (Heuer).

The SATs in the chapter “Hypothesis Generation and Testing” aid the analyst when dealing with deceptive, false, and incomplete information when predicting the future, as well. This chapter frequently refers to analyst employing the scientific method of developing numerous hypothesis in order to better their analysis. “Generating and testing hypothesis is a core function of intelligence analysis. A possible explanation of the past or judgment about the future is a hypothesis that needs to be tested by collecting and presenting evidence”, state Heuer

---

33 A “Black Swan” is an “event, positive or negative, that is deemed improbable yet causes massive consequences” (Taleb). An example of a black swan is the terrorist attacks on the United States that took place on September 11, 2001.
and Pherson. The authors note that analysts tend to use a form or reasoning to test these hypothesis called “abduction”. This process starts with a set of facts. From there, the analyst establishes hypothesis that if proven true, would provide the best explanation for the facts (Heuer). Heuer’s very own Analysis of Competing Hypothesis is an SAT within this section.

The next chapter, “Assessment of Cause and Effect” focuses primarily on explaining the past and forecasting the future. This is the chapter that I will pull my SAT from later in my thesis to analyze the human trafficking in Brazil case study. One of the main attributes of this chapter and its SATs is the ability to counter the most common forms of intelligence failure “mirror imaging”34 and downplaying situational factors. In Heuer’s “Psychology of Intelligence Analysis”, there are three strategies intelligence analysts use to make “judgements to explain the cause of current events or forecast what might happen in the future” (Heuer). These strategies are as follows—Situational Logic, Comparison with Historical Situations, and Applying Theory35.

Following “Assessment of Cause and Effect”, the authors describe SATs that belong in the “Challenge Analysis” chapter. These SATs encompass a set of analytic techniques that share a common goal in “challenging an established mental model or analytic consensus in order to broaden the range of possible explanations or estimates that are seriously considered” (Heuer). One of the advantages of employing these SATs is that they provide the analyst the framework to remove themselves from their analysis and analyze different perspectives on the same scenario.

34 “Mirror Imaging” is the unconscious assumption that other countries and their leaders will act as we [the United States] would in similar circumstances (Heuer).

35 Heuer describes terms as the following respectively, “making expert judgements based on the known facts and an understanding of the underlying forces at work at that particular time and place”, “combining an understanding of the facts of a specific situation with knowledge of what happened in similar situations in the past, either in one’s personal experience or historical events”, and “basing judgements on the systematic study of many examples of the same phenomenon” (Heuer).
These SATs prove especially crucial to intelligence analysis due to the fact that many of the past intelligence failures have been due to analysts’ inability to question a prior accepted judgment.

“Conflict Management” SATs are just that—SATs that aid the analyst when presented with conflicting scenarios or assessments. In the authors’ words, these SATs help answer two key questions, “how can confrontation be managed so that it becomes a learning experience rather than a battle between determine adversaries?” and, “in an analysis of any topic with a high degree of uncertainty, how can one decide if one view is wrong or if both views have merit and need to be discussed in an analytic report?” (Heuer). These specific SATs are often times used in the beginning of an analysis in order to broaden the analyst’s scope and take into consideration alternative theories.

The final section of SATs is titled, “Decision Support”. The advantage of employing these SATs is, “some decision-support techniques help overcome a cognitive limitation by laying out all the options and interrelationships in graphic form so that analysts can test the results of alternative options while still keeping the problem as a whole in view” (Heuer). An important stipulation is that the final decision and balancing tradeoffs is not the analysts’ job, but rather that of a high ranking official or commander. With that being said, it is the analysts’ job to aid in contextualizing these tradeoffs and providing future scenarios based on each tradeoff. The SATs in this chapter provide the framework for the analyst to do just that.

---

36 For example, many experienced analysts did not foresee the collapse of the Soviet Union and were even the last to accept the possibility of this “black swan” happening. Another example offered by the authors was China entering the Korean War. (Heuer).

37 The authors refer to this “cognitive limitation” as the limitation in humans’ short-term memory and the inability of the analyst to maintain a list of pros and cons accurately in the brain.
In order to better contextualize all 50 SATs, please see Figure 2.1. This figure divides the SATs into four overarching categories—“Imagination Techniques”, “Diagnostic Techniques”, “Reframing and Challenge Techniques”, and “Decision Support” (Pherson).

**Figure 2.1: Categories of SATs**
(Pherson)

---

**SAT Employed and Methodology in Brazil Human Trafficking Case Study:**

When setting out to pick the SAT I wanted to use in my analysis, I was torn in the beginning. I was not sure if I wanted to employ the Key Assumptions Check from the “Assessment of Cause and Effect” chapter or use the Indicators SAT from the “Scenarios and Indicators” chapter. I was able to eliminate other SATs and end up with these two at the end of
my methodology because these two specific SATs fit my direction and scope of my overall analysis. While other SATs would have proven useful and I would recommend an analyst employing when analyzing this case study, the Key Assumptions Check encompasses several other SATs into one.

The key deciding factor to use the Key Assumptions Check is that this SAT seems to best incorporate the largest number of SATs into one. Without realizing it, I was already using several SATs when conducting my Key Assumptions Check. For example, the Indicators SAT is a tool that I used to analyze the current Brazilian economic decline and what future scenarios that is likely to present. I used the Chronologies and Timelines SAT from the “Decomposition and Visualization” chapter in the Key Assumptions Check, as well, to better contextualize the rise and fall of human trafficking throughout Brazil’s history.

As previously stated, the SAT I will be employing in the following chapters to enhance my analysis is the Key Assumptions Check. This specific SAT is one of the most used and arguably, one of the most important SATs. According to Heuer and Pherson, “The Key Assumptions Check is a systematic effort to make explicit and question the assumptions that guide an analyst’s thinking” (Heuer). A main reason this SAT holds such immense value on the intelligence process is that judgements made by analysts are based on combinations of evidence and the analyst’s own preconceptions. This SAT aids the analyst in finding these preconceptions and identifying any intelligence gaps that are filled subconsciously without the analyst being aware. Since my analysis is focused on a foreign government, the analyst must take a step back and disconnect his/herself from thinking in terms of actions the U.S. government is likely to take.
The underlying argument of my analysis hinges on several key assumptions—that Brazil views human trafficking as an issue of national security, that the United States has an interest in human trafficking patterns within Brazil, and that the current economic crisis is likely to increase human trafficking throughout South America\textsuperscript{38}. My entire analysis is based off these assumptions, so when deciding which SAT to use, I thought the best one would be an SAT that directly challenges these key judgments. In their publication, “Structured Analytic Techniques for Intelligence Analysis”, Heuer and Pherson discuss the situations that are best for using a Key Assumptions Check.

Another advantage of employing this SAT in my analysis is that it can be re-done throughout the analytical process to keep the analysis up-to-date and factual. In fact, Heuer and Pherson recommend the analyst conduct the Check periodically in order to keep the analysis in scope. The authors also state that this SAT helps the analyst, “identify the specific assumptions that underline the basic analytic line, achieve a better understanding of the fundamental dynamics at play, gain a better perspective and stimulate new thinking about the issue, discover hidden relationships and links between key factors, identify any developments that would cause an assumption to be abandoned, and avoid surprise should new information render old assumptions invalid” (Heuer).

The process of conducting a Key Assumptions Check is straightforward. Yet, the authors highlight a dangerous obstacle—an analyst’s inability to accept the fact that he/she may be wrong. This inability is crucial to avoid when conducting intelligence analysis because it can greatly detour the process in the wrong direction. Heuer and Pherson outline a general step-by-

\textsuperscript{38} These Key Assumptions will be furthered analyzed in the actual NIE chapter of this thesis.
step for the analyst to take when conducting a Key Assumption Check. The first step is to “gather a group of individuals who are working the issue along with a few “outsiders”. The primary analytic unit already is working from an established mental model, so the “outsiders” are needed to bring other perspectives” (Heuer). For my SAT process, I met with several Brazilian natives and discussed my assumptions with them in order to have my assumptions challenged, and thus, strengthened. During this process, I came across new thoughts and thoughts that contradicted my original theories. Reaching out to “outsiders” aided my analysis and helped to strengthen my overall argument.

The next step is to quietly brainstorm assumptions individually and write these assumptions on note cards. These note cards are collected and hung on the wall for everyone to see. The advantage of doing this is to ensure that each person’s assumptions are not hindered by other analysts’ opinions and theories. It is suggested to “work from the prevailing analytic line back to the key argument that supports it” (Heuer). By doing this, the analyst is assuring there are minimal to no gaps in the intelligence process. Analysts should ask the “standard journalist questions”—who?, what?, when?, where? why? how?. These questions can be elaborated into—who are the key players in the scenario, what is the group assuming, when is this scenario likely to influence the United States, where is this process likely to take place, why is this a problem and concern for the United States, how will the analysts be sure to keep a broaden scope?

The following step is to go back and question each assumption. Heuer and Pherson offer the analyst the following questions to ask themselves during this step, “why am I confident that this assumption is correct?, in what circumstances might this assumption be untrue?, could it have been true in the past but no longer true today?, how much confidence do I have that this
assumption is valid?, and if it turns out to be invalid, how much impact would this have on the analysis” (Heuer). Next, the analyst should place each assumption into the following three categories: “basically solid”, “correct with some caveats”, and “unsupported or questionable”.

From this step in the SAT process, the analyst is advised to “refine the list, deleting those that do not hold up to scrutiny and adding new assumptions that emerge from the discussion” (Heuer). From here, the analyst should have a list of supported and critically examined assumptions. An important note offered by the authors is to remember that “the probability of your analytic conclusion being accurate cannot be greater than the weakest link in your chain of reasoning” (Heuer). By conducting this SAT, the analyst is ensuring no “satisficing” was done and the assumptions used throughout the analysis are solid and supported.

---

39 This term refers to the act of “choosing the first hypothesis that appears good enough rather than carefully identifying all possible hypotheses and determining which is most consistent with the evidence” (“Chapter 4”).
Chapter 3

National Intelligence Estimate: Human Trafficking in Brazil

General NIE Background:

This chapter takes the form of an NIE. It is formatted rather differently than traditional writing products such as Academic Journals and educational publications. In order for the reader to have a better understanding of this chapter and the different sections it will address, I will recap several characteristics of an NIE, as previously stated in Chapter 1.

NIEs consist of a scope note, key judgments, facts/evidence, and a discussion. While this format is altered slightly depending on the NIE’s intended customer, the IC tends to stick to this format in order to have a common variable understood by all intelligence agencies.

The scope note of an NIE is where the National Intelligence Officers [NIOs] outline the direction of the NIE product. In this section, the Officers detail the topic that will be addressed and why. They also detail any reasoning they had for the methods they undertook during their analysis. Also within this section, are the key questions (provided by the NIC) that will be answered throughout the product. Typically, there are only three to five key questions being asked due to the intense analysis and research required to properly address each question. Within this section, as well, the Officers inform the readers where they got their information/
intelligence; whether via open source or close source methods. Depending on the clearance levels of the customers requesting the NIE, different levels of information can be included in the NIE.

Following the scope note, comes the key judgments. Key judgments take the key questions provided by the NIC and put an estimative assessment on them. Each individual NIE has the same number of key questions and key judgments. The key judgment section is where the customer of the product gets a summarized assessment of the agencies’ answers to each question. This section is specifically important to the overall NIE product because it further defines the direction the intelligence product will go. In this section, the Officers provide levels of confidence on what they believe will be the answers to the questions provided by the NIC. These confidence levels are “low confidence”, “moderate confidence”, and “high confidence”. After the key judgment is given, in a sentence or two, the Officers provide a paragraph about what led them to this judgment. These judgments are further analyzed later in the “Discussion” section of the NIE.

After the key judgments, the Officers include a section of facts and evidence. This section is important to include because it provides the customer with the context and reasoning for the assessments made in the judgments. The facts/evidence section usually gives a general background of the topic being analyzed, as well. This is done to make sure the reader of the NIE is properly educated on the subject and can better follow the analysis later in the NIE. It is

40 “Open Source” information can be defined as, “a broad array of information and sources that are generally available, including information obtained from the media (newspapers, radio, television, etc.), professional and academic records (papers, conferences, professional associations, etc.), and public data (government reports, demographics, hearings, speeches, etc.).

“Closed Source” can be defined as, “those with restricted access, eg, police crime recording systems and information available through information sharing agreements (ISAs) with partners (“INTelligence: Open Source Intelligence”).

31
important to include this section, as well, because it aids the Officers in their analysis by laying out all the facts and evidence. If an NIE is using primarily open-source information, the Officers can be overwhelmed with the extremely high volume of information available to them. By assessing the importance each piece of evidence and fact possess, the analysis conducted by the Officers is strengthened.

Finally, the discussion section of the NIE is where the bulk of the Officers’ analysis is given. This section includes information from the previous sections, but also provides the Officers’ assessment and futuristic analysis. Within this section, the Officers include potential implications, consequences, and outcomes certain actions are likely to produce. It is important to identify the “so what?” in this section. The “so what?” in an NIE is the value-added to the Intelligence Community and its customers. It also makes the connection the product has to the United States. An NIE should always pertain to the U.S. regarding issues of national security. An NIE does not advise policy making, but rather, informs policy makers of potential re-actions, consequences, and severity of a future event/policy is likely to have.

NIEs contain their own bibliography, thus, the “Works Cited” section at the end of this chapter will pertain specifically to the analysis and facts within this chapter and the NIE.
Scope Note:

This National Intelligence Estimate [NIE] examines the likelihood of success regarding the current and future Brazilian anti-human trafficking policies within the next four to eight years. This time frame is chosen in order to align with the Brazilian Presidential elections.\textsuperscript{41} This NIE will analyze human trafficking from the perspective of the Brazilian government\textsuperscript{42}. While typical NIEs focus primarily on intelligence analysis, this NIE will take a unique approach and analyze human trafficking in Brazil in regard to its policies and how these policies have potential to impact the United States. It also focuses on creating political analysis that can aid the United States’ understanding on Brazil. This NIE will also analyze the potential positive and negative effects upon the United States if the Brazilian government fails to address human trafficking as an issue of national security. This NIE will also employ a Structured Analytic Technique [SAT] to further refine my analysis.\textsuperscript{43}

This NIE will focus of the following questions:

- What are the current anti-trafficking policies in Brazil, and are they working?

- What changes need to be made to address human trafficking within Brazil, and are Brazilian politicians likely to make them in the next four to eight years?

\textsuperscript{41}Dilma Rousseff is the current President of Brazil. She was elected in 2011 and re-elected in 2015. Due to Brazil’s constitutional limit of two terms per person for the Presidency, I chose to focus this NIE on the next four to eight years in order to capture the second term of President Rousseff and her predecessor.

\textsuperscript{42}The reasoning for this is to better equip the US Government with insight into the likely actions the Brazilian will take concerning human trafficking.

\textsuperscript{43}The SAT I will use in my intelligence product with be a Key Assumptions Check. My reasoning in choosing this specific SAT is due to the fact Key Assumptions Check is an assessment of cause and effect based on past events. It also employs futuristic analysis that will aid in forecasting potential outcomes.
• If Brazil does not take the proper steps to decrease human trafficking within the next four to eight years, what is likely to happen in Brazil?

• How could a failure to address human trafficking in Brazil lead to an overall increase in human trafficking in South America?

All of the information and facts presented in this NIE will be from open sources.
Key Judgments:

A.) I assess with high confidence that the current Brazilian policies instituted to combat human trafficking are not working sufficiently to address this national security issue.

1.) One of the major stipulations within Brazil’s Penal Code legislation is the failure to address a definition for “exploitation”. While the Palermo Protocol states what exploitation is, Brazil’s policies and legislation fail to properly define it and how it is intertwined with trafficking as a whole. In order for a human trafficking case to be tried in the Brazilian courts as a “human trafficking” case, an act of movement must occur. Brazil defines human trafficking as a movement-based crime, while the “international standard defines the act of recruitment and transfer of human beings for exploitation to be human trafficking” (Jiang). This distinction in definition leads to under-reporting of trafficking cases, but also confusion on what constitutes a human trafficking case in Brazil.

B.) I assess with moderate confidence Brazilian policy makers are not likely to improve anti-human trafficking policies in the next four to eight years.

1.) Human trafficking is an industry that thrives off internal governmental corruption. This is especially true for human trafficking within Brazil. According to the Global Corruption Barometer, 50% of the Brazilian population stated they believed their government was corrupt ("Global Corruption Barometer 2013 –

---

44 This Protocol will be further discussed in the “Facts and Evidence” section of this NIE.
Results”). Along with a low public approval of its government, Brazil also ranks 76th out of 168 countries on Transparency International’s Corruption Percentage Index for 2015. Brazil scored a 38 on a scale of one (most corrupt) to 100 (very clean) (“Corruption PerceptionsIndex 2015”). Brazilian lower court judges are known for being paid off by traffickers to not investigate cases of trafficking, and also to postpone the court cases up to five years or until the statue of limitation passed (Jiang).

C.) I assess with moderate confidence that if Brazil fails to combat human trafficking within its borders in the next four to eight years, there will likely be a regional increase in South America of human trafficking, originating from Brazil.

1.) According to the U.S. State Department, the four main human trafficking countries in South America besides Brazil, are Peru, Argentina, Bolivia, and Colombia. Brazil has the fastest and most powerful economy in the region as of 2015 (“Country Comparison GDP - per Capita (PPP)). This characteristic provides potential offenders a more stable country to infiltrate and establish their trafficking business. However, the Brazilian government has recently experienced a stark decline in its economy. If human trafficking remains unaddressed, the issue is likely to only increase. As traffickers seek more economically stable South American countries, human trafficking is likely to spread throughout the entire continent.
**Facts and Evidence:**

A general overview and background of human trafficking is necessary before I begin my core analysis. It is also important to note due to the complexity of the crime and the dynamic national security issue human trafficking presents in both Brazil and the United States.

Human trafficking is a 32 billion USD industry globally and accounts for 21 billion USD worth of unpaid wages per year (Goodie). This crime victimizes 600,000 to 800,000 people worldwide. Not only is human trafficking a threat to national security, but it is also obstructing human rights throughout the world. This industry corrupts global supply chains throughout the world. In a report issued by the Polaris Project, the U.S. Government has found ties of over 136 goods from 74 countries in the United States originating from forced labor factories throughout the world, which is logical since over 82 million children are victims of child labor throughout the world (“POLARIS-Supply Chains”).

An official definition for human trafficking is one that is contradicted by many governments, nations, and supra national organizations. For the purpose of this intelligence product, the definition I will be using is the one established by the United Nations and accepted by the United States in the 2000 *Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime*. The Palermo Protocol, formally known as the *United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress, and...*

---

45 This is due to the fact that certain governments’ policies are not specific enough or do not address every form of trafficking within their borders.
Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, defines human trafficking on an international scale:

“[T]rafficking in persons shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include the exploitation of prostitution or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labor, slavery, servitude, or the removal or organs ("Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons").

Forms of Human Trafficking in Brazil

Human trafficking in Brazil exists in multiple forms—sex trafficking, forced labor trafficking, organ trafficking, and human smuggling. The main demographics of victims such as, lower class, uneducated, and urban area located, are similar in almost all cases and in all forms of human trafficking. With a countrywide poverty rate of 8.9%, approximately 18 million Brazilians fall under this category ("Brazil"). Increasing economic inequality and a poverty rate inclining mere percentages every other year, the target population needed to conduct human trafficking is an easy demographic group to target and manipulate.
1. Sex Trafficking/Human Smuggling:\footnote{46} Sex trafficking is the most popular form of human trafficking in Brazil, with 3,000 Brazilians being transported abroad and subjected mainly to sexual exploitation ("Brazil Lagging in Fight against Human Trafficking"). While many people believe sex trafficking and human smuggling are the same crime, they are actually very different. Victims of these specific forms of trafficking reach the high numbers of 600,000 to 800,000 Internationally ("Fact Sheet: Distinctions Between Human Smuggling and Human Trafficking 2006"). On average, over 1,000 people a year are trafficked within Brazil’s borders and internationally, according to a public hearing on “Tráfico de pessoas: prevenção, repressão, acolhimento, às vitimas e parcerias".\footnote{47}

Both sex trafficking and human smuggling offenders prey on similar demographics and victims. Much like the other forms of human trafficking in Brazil, Brazilians of extreme poverty, those lacking economic opportunity, and those with poor education systems tend to be victims of sex trafficking and human smuggling ("Brazil Lagging in Fight against Human Trafficking"). The geographic locations of these crimes are very similar, with many sex trafficking and human smuggling crimes being committed in the Northeast region of Brazil where there is civil unrest and high political uncertainty. In the case of human smuggling, the relationship between the handler and the victim is temporary and quick. Once the transportation has been made, this

\footnote{46} According to the United States State Department, human smuggling is defined as, “the facilitation, transportation, attempted transportation or illegal entry of a person(s) across an international border, in violation of one or more countries laws, either clandestinely or through deception, such as the use of fraudulent documents”.

\footnote{47} Which translates to “Trafficking in persons: prevention, repression, care of victims and illegal” associations.
relationship ends and the handler and victim split ties with each other. One of the main differences between sex trafficking and human smuggling, especially in Brazil, is the fact that many times the smuggling is committed with the permission of the victim. In Brazil, where corruption runs rampant, many people see human smuggling as a way to pay off debt or be reunited with family members ("Brazil Lagging in Fight against Human Trafficking"). Human smuggling is not a “nicer” form of sex trafficking, and in fact, human smuggling victims can become sex trafficking victims through deception and force.

Unlike human smuggling, the relationship between handler and victim of sex trafficking crimes generally last the whole duration of captivity (Jiang). As mentioned above, some victims of sex trafficking are deceived human smuggling victims. Sex trafficking always incorporates some form of “harboring, transportation, provision or obtaining persons for the exploitation of services, labor, or sex”, and often times, work-based debts create new victims in the sex trafficking industry ("Brazil Lagging in Fight against Human Trafficking"). Sex trafficking is the form of human trafficking in Brazil that takes public precedent over all the other forms of trafficking.

2. Slave Labor: Although slave labor, or “trabalho escravo”, is illegal in Brazil according to Brazilian Penal Code Article 149, it is estimated that affects more than 40,000 Brazilians (Wells, et al). A growing pattern begins to emerge with human trafficking demographics in Brazil. Similar to other forms of trafficking, much of the slave labor that takes place in Brazil is
in the Northeast region’s poor states—Piauí, Tocantins, and Bahia (Looft). The cattle industries, mines, sugar cane fields, and industrial factories located in this rural region create a rising industry for exploiting Brazilians into forced labor. Brazil “is the world's largest coffee and sugarcane producer, as well as the second largest soybean producer. Thanks to an abundant livestock resource, it has the second largest number of cattle in the world after India and is the world's largest producer and the second largest beef exporter” ("Rural Poverty Portal").

The process of slave labor in Brazil begins with “gatos”\(^{48}\) who scout out potential victims and prey on Brazilians that are about to become a source of monetary gain. In fact, over 80% of the Northeast region’s population is illiterate and 75% of the population lives below the poverty line\(^{49}\). This region consists of nine states and about 27% of the population (Forero). Gatos and other slave labor operators have plenty of potential victims to choose from, with this 27% of the population working by the time they are 16 and usually without any type of education. Due to the lack of education, many Northeast Brazilians easily fall victim to Gatos manipulation. Gatos use forms of abuse, threats, and even death to maintain their slave labor work force (Looft).

In 2012, a major step towards combatting human trafficking was achieved. This policy affects the forced labor industry, specifically. The Land Expropriation Act of 2012, informally known as PEC 438, stated the government can and will take land from industries and groups who fail to comply by the forced labor regulations (Wells). Along with losing their land, offenders can

\(^{48}\) Which translates to “cats”

\(^{49}\) See Figure 3.1 to see a breakdown of the regions in Brazil.
face up to eight years in jail and heavy fines. However, it is worth noting that PEC 438, which was introduced to the Brazilian Senate in 1995 and only passed a first round of voting by the Senate in 2004, does not provide a set definition for slave labor/forced labor (Looft).

Another positive step towards combatting slave labor is the “Dirty List”, or “Suja Lista” established by the Brazilian government Ministry of Labor and Employment [MLE] in 2004. This is a list of over 300 companies known to engage in slave labor throughout Brazil. Several well-known banks, both international and domestic, have refused to conduct business with companies on the list, and the Ministry of National Integration [MIN] has publicly advised other financial bodies to avoid providing any financial help to these offenders, as well (Pierce).

3. Organ Trafficking: In Brazil, the buying and selling of human organs is illegal and can result in up to eight years in prison. This law was established in Brazil in 1997 (Osava). However, Brazil is a country known for supplying organs to foreign nations like the United States. In a report issued by the World Health Organization, "brokers reportedly charged between US$ 100,000 and US$ 200,000 to organize a transplant for wealthy patients. Donors — frequently impoverished and under educated—may receive as little as $1,000 USD for a kidney although the average price is more likely to be about $5,000 USD" ("Organ Trafficking and Transplantation Pose New Challenges"). The many people living in the slums of Brazil see the possibly of selling a kidney, a liver, or any organ that can be successfully, transplanted a quick

50 The definition for organ trafficking is as follows, “trafficking of human organs is to facilitate or participate in the illegal transfer of human organs” ("Protocol to Prevent, Suppress, and Punish Trafficking in Persons").
fix to their family's or their own financial burdens\textsuperscript{51}. Countries like Brazil have become known as "transplant tourist" spots where impoverished neighborhoods are prime targets for organ trafficking rings\textsuperscript{52}.

\textsuperscript{51} The World Bank estimate 4.9\% of Brazilians were living in poverty in 2013, with the average Brazilian making 1.90 USD per day ("Poverty & Equity").

\textsuperscript{52} "Transplant Tourism" is defined as “potential recipients who travel abroad to undergo organ transplantation” (Shimazono).
Discussion:

I assess with high confidence that the current Brazilian policies instituted to combat human trafficking are not working sufficiently to address this national security issue.

One of the major stipulations with this Protocol, and within Brazil’s Penal Code legislation is the failure to address a definition for “exploitation”. While the Palermo Protocol states what exploitation is, Brazil’s policies and legislation fail to properly define it and how it is intertwined with trafficking as a whole. An unforeseen outcome of this policy is the other forms of trafficking that also take place within Brazil’s borders are placed in a category of less significance, such as forced labor, organ trafficking, and human smuggling.

These specific definitions limit political attention and government intervention by focusing the meaning of human trafficking on one form rather than them all. Human trafficking for sexual exploitation is the prime example. Many nations that have adopted the Palermo Protocol, especially Brazil, have limited their definition of human trafficking to focus on the more publicly aware form: human trafficking for sexual exploitation. By doing this, human trafficking in its other forms has become a much more prominent issue throughout the world, and Brazil, due to lack of overall awareness and political agendas focusing on human trafficking for sexual exploitation (Venson). By having underlying connections between prostitution and exploitation within Brazil’s society, it is likely that the general assessment will remain to assume
human trafficking for sexual exploitation is the main problem within Brazil. This denies many policy windows for policy alterations to open.

It is my judgment that Brazil has failed to evolve its laws and legislations concerning human trafficking and thus, all types of trafficking in its borders are on a rise. There is an increasing pressure to establish strong, straightforward regulations to eliminate this industry. Due to Brazil’s rise as a global power in the past decade, it is likely Brazil will become more of a destination country for migrants whom could be targeted as potential victims. In 2013, the Brazilian government announced a three-year plan to combat human trafficking within its borders. This is the second government plan attempted by the Brazilian government, with the first one lasting from 2008-2010 (Wells). The first national plan was not deemed a success mainly due to the fact that it failed to address internal sex trafficking and establishing no penalty for the act, which my assessment agrees with.

The new national plan is designed to combat human trafficking within Brazil’s borders and increase awareness. The Brazilian government is currently investing over three million dollars to create ten new border patrol posts. The hope of the government is that these new posts will increase the likelihood of encountering potential victims and catching the offenders. I assess with high confidence this will not be enough to combat trafficking in the region. My assessment is based on the fact that Brazil’s land border is approximately 15,700 kilometers long, with shared borders to 10 out of the 12 countries in South America ("Leading the Fight against
Human Trafficking in Brazil”). My assessment is also based on the fact that Brazil currently has a very porous land border due to the severe lack of governmental oversight and manpower.

For example, there is only one officer for every 10 miles of land around Brazil’s borders. In regard to its sea and water borders, between Bolivia and Brazil alone there are over 2,100 miles with a port every 100 meters (Forero). This example speaks volumes when it comes to analyzing the need for more governmental personal along Brazilian borders. Due to Brazil’s inability to monitor and enforce the prior regulations, I assess this second governmental plan will not be successful in combatting human trafficking, either. With this plan’s timeframe ending in 2016, there is little to no improvement regarding human trafficking within Brazil’s borders.

Several current policy limitations to combatting human trafficking are the short statute of limitations for forced labor cases. Often times, the statute of limitation expires before the proper procedural processes in the Labor Courts can be processed. There are also very weak sentences attached to these convictions; therefore, leaving a very meager incentive for offenders to follow the laws. In 2012, another major step towards combatting human trafficking was made. This policy affects the forced labor industry, specifically. The Land Expropriation Act of 2012, informally known as PEC 438, stated the government can and will take land from industries and groups who fail to comply by the forced labor regulations (Wells). It is my judgement that the

---

53 See Figure 3.2 for all of Brazil’s points of entry.
inability to define the act of forced labor will lead to an increase in this type of trafficking due to offenders ability to manipulate the laws.

I assess this is a key factor in the failure of Brazil to combat human trafficking. My judgment is based primarily on Brazil having powerful agri-business lobbyist firms and powerful big business companies push their political agendas and seek loopholes to avoid penalties (Looft). For example, I assess many slave labor perpetrators are likely to respond better to the laws against slave labor if they are threatened to lose their land if caught. Along with the possibility of losing their land, the offenders face eight or more years in jail and heavy fines, as approved by the Lower Legislative House (Looft).

I assess with moderate confidence Brazilian policy makers are not likely to improve anti-human trafficking policies in the next four to eight years.

Human trafficking is an industry in Brazil that thrives off internal governmental corruption. According to the Global Corruption Barometer, 50% of the Brazilian population stated they believed their government was corrupt ("Global Corruption Barometer 2013 – Results”). In 1995, according to the Brazilian Special Mobile Inspection Group [GEFM], labor inspection teams investigated complaints with the “aim to free workers and prosecute abusive employers. As a result over 32,000 workers were freed from abusive and coercive labor conditions from 1995 to 2008” (Pierce). Governmental officials are likely to face extreme opposition if they attempt to regulate trafficking in Brazil due to the industry’s ability to infiltrate all regions of the country and produce high profits.
Brazilian labor courts generally take years to process cases. As such, the small amount of slave labor cases that do get brought to court are not processed fast enough and expire; therefore, resulting to few if any actual verdicts. Due to that, the limited number of slave labor cases that do get brought to court are not processed fast enough and expire; therefore, resulting to few if any actual verdicts. Many of these cases are preceded over by judges whom receive payments from trafficking offenders to prolong cases or to not prosecute at all (Jiang).

I assess Brazilian policymakers are not likely to improve anti-trafficking policies within the next four to eight years—“[a]s of the end of February 2016, 84 notable politicians, business executives, and associates had been convicted in federal courts of embezzlement of public funds, conspiracy, and money laundering, and had served or were serving hard time” (Sotero). This is based on the increased corruption Brazil is experiencing, as well as, a decreasing economic stature. In fact, in 2004, the Labor Ministry decided to inspect Brazilian Senator João Ribeiro's farm as an audit. While there, they reported over 35 laborers working the farm. These laborers told the auditors they work over 80 hours a week and the conditions they work in were “sub human” (Phillips). After these findings, Senator Ribeiro was fined 750,000 Reais, which equals approximately only 199,000 USD.

The cases that are made through the judicial system do not carry harsh punishments, such as weak sentences ranging from five months to one-year probation (Looft). I assess this is a specific problem Brazil needs to address in order to see an increase in the amount of guilty verdicts reached with slave labor cases. With little incentive to abide by the laws and regulations regarding slave labor, many perpetrators of this crime are not likely to terminate their practices.
assess with high confidence that if Brazil does not begin to prioritize human trafficking as a national security issue within the next four to eight years, its country is likely to face increased civil and political unrest due to the populous’ frustration and governmental corruption.

Currently, Brazil is experiencing one of the country’s biggest governmental corruption scandals, and I assess this will shift attention and potential policies away from the anti-human trafficking efforts. According to the Heritage Foundation, [i]n 2014, a former director of state-owned Petrobras accused more than 40 politicians, including one minister and three governors, in a massive kickback investigation. Brazil’s judiciary is inefficient and subject to political and economic influence. The court system is overburdened, and contract disputes can be lengthy and complex” (“Brazil”). The current Brazilian President, Dilma Rousseff, is the chosen successor for Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva, who was the Brazilian President from 2003 to 2011. During his terms as President, several cabinet and high ranking officials are said to have money laundered financial assets fro Petrobras (“Brazil Ex-president Lula Da Silva in Corruption Probe - BBC News”)55. Currently, President Rousseff has denied any involvement in the matter, but popular opinion in Brazil states the contrary. Many Brazilians are outraged at the allegations and demand the immediate impeachment of President Rousseff.

54 Petrobras is, “is a semi-public Brazilian multinational energy corporation headquartered in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil”. It has an revenue of 130 billion USD and is the largest company in the Souther Hemisphere. The Brazilian government owns 54% of the company.

55 According to BBC News, “ Federal prosecutors allege that a cartel of companies and contractors working for Petrobras had overcharged the company billions of dollars for major contracts. They say the extra money found its way into the pockets of executives and politicians of many parties including Mr Lula's Workers Party”. Dilma Rousseff is a member of the Workers’s Party.
I assess this public disapproval is likely to create more civil and political instability in the region, which is likely to create a vacuum for human trafficking offenders to exploit. While many Brazilians are experiencing a declining economy and increased unemployment due to the Federal government’s corruption, human trafficking is likely to become the stabilizing industry to fill this void. With that being said, I assess Brazil will transform into a “transit” trafficking country, rather than a destination country. Traffickers are likely to see Brazil as an increasing unstable country, and seek new locations for their businesses; however, Brazil’s unique geographic location and sea ports are likely to secure Brazil’s status as a top human trafficking country in the region through intermediate transportation.

While this example of governmental corruption does not specifically address human trafficking, it highlights the deep and corrosive corruption that is present in the Brazilian government. I assess internal governmental corruption is a key factor contributing to human trafficking in Brazil, and will likely increase in the next four to eight years due to the international attention this current scandal is receiving. The Brazilian government is not likely to institute additional anti-trafficking policies due to the upheaval the Federal government is currently in. It is likely human trafficking policies will be put on “the back burner” during this time of corruption.

---

56 From 2010 to 2015, Brazil’s economy grew three times faster than the U.S.’ economy. Government expenditures consume more than 40 percent of GDP. “The pace of Brazil’s regulatory reform has slowed, and the tax burden is much heavier than in many other emerging economies. Corruption is high, private property rights are insecure, and the judicial system remains vulnerable to political influence”, stated the Heritage Foundation.

57 Countries are labeled as either “source, “transit”, or “destination” countries based on the activities and characteristics of human trafficking in that country.
I assess with moderate confidence that if Brazil fails to combat human trafficking within its borders in the next four to eight years, there will likely be a regional increase in South America of human trafficking, originating from Brazil.

In South America, the four main human trafficking countries besides Brazil, according to the U.S. State Department, are Peru, Argentina, Bolivia, and Colombia. Brazil had the fastest and most powerful economy in the region the past decade. This characteristic provides potential offenders a more stable country to infiltrate and establish their business; however, Brazil is currently experiencing a declining economy, increased inflation, and increased unemployment. I assess this decline in economic power is likely to cause trafficking offenders to seek new countries to establish their business. In order to properly analyze the issue at hand within Brazil’s borders, I assess it is important to evaluate neighboring countries’ policies, as well as economic stature.

Human trafficking in Brazil is especially important to note due to the fact that Brazil is the largest economy in South America, with a Gross Domestic Product [GDP] per capita of around 11,200 USD annually ("Brazil Economy - GDP, Inflation, CPI and Interest Rate"). The fact that Brazil is the largest economy is South America means that it attracts trafficking offenders in the region to establish the industry within Brazil’s borders. Compared to the four main human trafficking countries in South America, Brazil has the second highest GDP, behind Argentina at 14, 700 USD ("Brazil Economy - GDP, Inflation, CPI and Interest Rate"). The other two ranking countries are Colombia and Bolivia, which have the lowest GDPs per capita,
with 7,830 USD and 2,860 USD, respectively ("List of South American Countries by GDP per Capita").

These statistics are important to note because they highlight the low annual income per household. It is worth noting that many victims of human trafficking are taken advantage of not only because of their lack of general knowledge, but more importantly economic stature. By having such low GDPs per capita, this region is an easy target for victim manipulation. While Brazil seems to fall towards the middle of these rankings in comparison to surrounding countries, Brazil has the fastest growing and most powerful economy in the region. This characteristic provides potential offenders a more stable country to infiltrate and establish their business. This is illustrated by comparing GDP Purchasing Power Parity [PPP] because it eliminates the spurious exchange rate variability.

Brazil has the highest GDP Purchasing Power Parity [PPP] with a total of 2,416 billion USD. In order to properly analyze the issue at hand within Brazil’s borders, it is important to evaluate neighboring countries’ policies and regulations—followed by Argentina at 771 billion USD, Colombia at 527 billion USD, Peru at 344 billion USD, and Bolivia at 59 billion USD ("GDP (purchasing Power Parity) by Country - Thematic Map - South America").

With all this being said, another factor of concern is the 2015 decline in Brazil’s economy. I assess with high confidence there is potential for an overflow of human trafficking.

---

58 In fact, in 2010 the United National Development Program [UNDP] put together a study that showed the top 15 countries with the worst income inequality (Rubel). Six of the fifteen countries listed are located in South America. Bolivia received the worst score with an income inequality rating of 60 out of 100 in terms of inequality. Brazil was 8th, Colombia was 10th, and Chile was 14th (Rubel).

59 See Figure 3.3

60 See Figure 3.4
from Brazil to other South American countries where economies are more stable. This is of special concern to the U.S. due to the fact the overflow is likely to increase civil and political unrest throughout the entire region and compromise trade U.S. has established with countries within this region. Currently, “U.S. goods and private services trade with Brazil totaled $107 billion in 2012. Exports totaled $68 billion; Imports totaled $39 billion. The U.S. goods and services trade surplus with Brazil was $29 billion in 2012” (“Brazil | United States Trade Representative”). I assess human trafficking has the ability to decrease trade not only between the United States and Brazil, but also all of South America.

61 Latest data available.

62 Here is a link to Office of the United States Trade Representative’s page elaborating on the trade partnership between U.S. and Brazil: https://ustr.gov/countries-regions/americas/brazil

63 The U.S. was Brazil’s 7th largest exporter in 2013, as well, with the “top export categories (2-digit HS) in 2013 as: Machinery ($7.3 billion), Mineral Fuel ($6.5 billion), Aircraft ($5.3 billion), Electrical Machinery ($5.2 billion), and Organic Chemicals ($2.3 billion)”, according to the Office of the United States Trade Representative.
Figure 3.1: Brazil’s Regions and States

Source: http://www.brazil-help.com/mapa_do_brasil.gif
Figure 3.2: Brazil Points of Entry
"Agência Nacional De Transportes Terrestres."
Figure 3.3: Country Comparison Graph: PPP
"GDP (purchasing Power Parity) by Country - Thematic Map - South America."
Figure 3.4: Country Comparison Graph: GDP Per Capita

Source: "Country Comparison GDP - per Capita (PPP)"
Works Cited


Chapter 4

Evaluation of SAT and NIE Using the Case Study Example

The purpose of this chapter is to bring the thesis “full circle”. This chapter serves as a conclusion chapter in that it recaps key points from the previous four chapters, and it also provides results/outcomes of the NIE analysis and SAT employment. Chapter 5 will serve as a debrief of the entire thesis and what has been discussed thus far in prior chapters.

The Introduction provided a synopsis to the thesis and informed the reader what direction the thesis would follow. The main purposes of the thesis were explained in this introduction and the overall goal of the thesis was also stated along with describing the need and importance for conducting the thesis and how the IC can use the product to better inform policymakers in future decisions. Chapter 1 established the roles of an NIE and the value they bring to the IC. Within this chapter, the reader was equipped with a break-down of the hierarchy of actors within the NIE process. By doing this, the reader was better able to understand the different actors and roles members of not only the IC play, but also members of academia, NGOs, and policymakers. This chapter also described the different writing style NIEs posses—scope note, key judgements, facts and evidence, and discussion sections. Chapter 1 provides a base for which the reader can properly understand the rest of the thesis. Following the breakdown of an NIE format, Chapter 1 also established the case study that is at the center of focus for this thesis—human trafficking in Brazil.

From there, Chapter 2 incorporates a intricate background on SATs, their value added to the intelligence process, and my methodology for choosing that specific SAT and the process
conducted. Chapter 2 began with a brief background of the two authors who wrote the definitive work regarding SATs—“Structured Analytic Techniques for Intelligence Analysis”. I felt it necessary to provide my reader with the needed background on all SATs and their importance to the intelligence process. I chose to describe SATs as a whole first in order to better contextualize SATs in their entirety and also to better explain why I chose to employ the SAT I did. By categorizing the 50 SATs into eight over-arching sections, I was able to take a large number SATs and better describe them to my reader. From there, Chapter 2 describes the specific SAT I chose to use in the NIE case study—a Key Assumptions Check. Not only did I discuss why I chose a Key Assumptions Check, but I also take the reader step-by-step through my methodology of employing the SAT.

Chapter 3 presented the actual NIE and the case study. I began that chapter by reminding the reader that NIEs are unique in writing style and do not take the regular form of writing, such as academic journal writing style. I went on to begin the NIE, presenting it as its own product. I wrote the NIE in typical analytical writing, with a scope note, key judgements, facts and evidence, and finally a discussion section. In the discussion section, I added my personal analysis and elaborated on my key judgements. This section is the most important section of an NIE because that is the section in which the analyst provides his/her analysis. I chose to make this section longer in order to ensure thorough analysis.

Finally, Chapter 4 encompasses the previous three chapters and brings the thesis is its ending point. It not only provides the overall findings of how an NIE and SAT within a case study illustrates US interests and national security threats abroad. During this chapter, the
findings from my SAT are described at length and an analysis of the value added of the NIE is given.

**Key Assumptions Check Background:**

As stated in Chapter 2, SATs are tools that help fascinate intelligence analysis. The SAT I chose to employ is the Key Assumptions Check. Key Assumptions Checks entail the following components:

- “The Key Assumptions Check is a systematic effort to make explicit and question the assumptions that guide an analyst’s thinking” (Heuer).
- Main reason this SAT holds such immense value on the intelligence process is that judgements made my analyst are based on combinations of evidence and the analyst’s own preconceptions.
- This SAT aids the analyst in finding these preconceptions and identifying any intelligence gaps that are filled subconsciously without the analyst being aware.
- I was already using several SATs when conducting my Key Assumptions Check.
  - For example, the Indicators SAT is a tool that I used to analyze the current Brazilian economic decline and what future scenarios that is likely to present.
  - I used the Chronologies and Timelines SAT from the “Decomposition and Visualization” chapter in the Key Assumptions Check, as well, to better contextualize the rise and fall of human trafficking throughout Brazil’s history.
- Overview of steps for a Key Assumptions Check (Heuer):
  - Gather small group working on the issue
• Brainstorm assumptions and write them on cards

• Collect cards and hang them on the wall

• Work backwards, asking “who”, “what”, “when”, “where”, “why”, and “how”

• Go back and critically examine each assumption

• Place each assumption in the following categories: “solid”, “caveated”, or “unsupported”

• Refine the list, deleting those that do not hold up to scrutiny

• Consider key uncertainties and if they should be converted into the intelligence product

• Overview of value added for a Key Assumptions Check (Heuer):
  
  • Identify the specific assumptions that underpin the basic analytic line
  
  • Achieve a better understanding of the fundamental dynamics at play
  
  • Gain a better perspective and stimulate new thinking about the issue
  
  • Discover hidden relationships and links between key factors
  
  • Identify any developments that would cause an assumption to be abandoned
  
  • Avoid surprise should new information render old assumptions invalid

Table 4.1 below presents the key assumptions made in the NIE in Chapter 3. The Table illustrates how these key assumptions played out in the case study and the assessment of each one categorized with either a “solid”, “caveated”, or “unsupported” label. These are provided for a base of the SAT findings and analysis that follow the Table.
Table 4.1: Key Assumptions Check

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assumption</th>
<th>Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Human trafficking is an increasing problem within Brazil.</td>
<td><strong>Solid.</strong> The U.S. State Department ranks Brazil as a Tier 2 country in their annual “Trafficking in Persons Report”. Human trafficking exists in multiple forms throughout the country—sex trafficking, forced labor, organ trafficking, and human smuggling. The number of reports of human trafficking in Brazil has risen 1,500 percent in 2013 (Well).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Brazil views the issue of human trafficking as one of national security.</td>
<td><strong>Caveated.</strong> Being a “Tier 2” country means that Brazil has addressed the issue of human trafficking, but their laws still do not comply with international standards. Since 2008, the Brazilian government has given millions of dollars and dedicated two national plans to combat human trafficking within their borders.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Brazil’s economic status influences human trafficking within its border, as well as, throughout South America.</td>
<td><strong>Caveated.</strong> While this is likely to increase, it is too early in Brazil’s recession to give this assessment a “solid” classification. Brazil’s strong and stable economy originally attracted traffickers to Brazil, but with the recent decline in Brazil’s economy, traffickers are less attracted to Brazil; thus, creating an overflow of trafficking throughout South America.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SAT Findings and Analysis:

My SAT product proved to be quite helpful in my overall analysis within the case study. While it did confirm several of my key assumptions, it also highlighted weaknesses in several other key assumptions. One of the main advantages of employing a Key Assumptions Check is “achieving a better understanding of the fundamental dynamics at play” (Heuer). This particular advantage was one that I really saw shine in my SAT intelligence product. After conducting the Check, I realized how dynamic of a security threat human trafficking poses on not only Brazil, but also the United States. While immediate impacts of human trafficking actions in Brazil are

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assumption</th>
<th>Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4. Human trafficking in Brazil affects the United States.</td>
<td><strong>Solid.</strong> If Brazil fails to comply with U.S. State Department regulations, further economic relations could negatively impact the United States. The State Department prioritizes human trafficking issues and trafficking has the ability to hinder U.S./Brazil relations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Human trafficking will not be addressed adequately in the next four to eight years.</td>
<td><strong>Caveated.</strong> Brazil is currently experiencing a political crisis. Many Brazilians are calling for immediate impeachment of President Rousseff for illegal money laundering and cover-ups. During her unknown time of presidency left, it is unlikely the government will have time nor desire to combat issues such as human trafficking.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
not obvious, the potential to disrupt economic trade supplies and undermine human rights are factors that could propel trafficking throughout the continent. I will describe my reasoning and thought process for each judgments’ classification, working backwards starting with assumption five.

One of the potential weaknesses of any intelligence analysis is solely viewing an issue from the view of the United States government. This SAT helped me view the problem of human trafficking from the perspective of the Brazilian government. By taking more of a “red hat analysis” approach, I was able to make higher probability predictions of the Brazilian government. From employing my SAT, I also learned my assumption of Brazil not being able to address human trafficking within the next four to eight years is very likely. In the beginning on my analysis, I would have put this assumption as “Unsupported”. However, after my analysis, I feel much more confident in this assumption. The SAT also helped solidify my argument that human trafficking in Brazil is likely to impact the United States, as well. This is a very important assumption validation because it is the underlying argument of my analysis. If this assumption proved to be “Unsupported”, there would be minimal reason to conduct the NIE in the first place since NIEs are written on issues that affect the United States.

Another one of my key assumptions that proved to support my overall analysis was the fact that Brazil’s economy plays a role in increasing human trafficking throughout the continent. While Brazil was an economic powerhouse for the past several years, it has recently began a decline. I classified this assumption as “Caveated” because I believe it is too early in the

---

64 “Red Hat Analysis” is another SAT mentioned in the same chapter as the Key Assumptions Check. Red Hat Analysis help the analyst predict and foresee the actions of a specific person or entity. In the case of my analysis, the Brazilian government filled this role.
economic decline to label it “Solid”. The decline began in 2015 and not being able to assess a full year of this decline and the unforeseen consequences because of a lack of information, is perhaps, an inevitable weakness of the SAT process. Heuer and Pherson advise the analyst to conduct regular updates of their SATs and the Key Assumptions Check is one of the main SATs that can change throughout time. I expect this assumption to change from “Caveated” to “Solid” within the next year.

The next judgement is that Brazil even views human trafficking as a national security threat. This is another one of the underlying assumptions that give this product validity. If Brazil did not view human trafficking as a national security threat, that would diminish the need for this report. This assumption is another one where I employed more of a Red Hat Analysis when evaluating the classification. The Brazilian government desires to become a global power, and with that comes the responsibility of upholding human rights and the dedication to combatting human trafficking. In order to become a respected member of the global powers, Brazil must first address internationally recognized issues within its own borders.

The remaining judgement was that human trafficking is increasing in Brazil. While I knew this was true from the beginning of my analysis, it provided me with a baseline from which to operate. This assumption provided the main reason for conducting this NIE. I gave this assumption a “Solid” classification due to its overall accepted accuracy. Many different sources acknowledge the fact human trafficking is increasing in Brazil and is likely to increase in the future. The fact that human trafficking is multi-dimensional in Brazil, by existing in multiple forms, aids in the “Solid” classification given this assumption.
Conducting a Key Assumptions Check resulted in the support of my overall NIE judgements. After working through this SAT, I feel much more confident in the accuracy of my analytical judgements. The only potential weakness is that it might suffer from a solely U.S. viewpoint and inadequately incorporate Brazilian perspective. I would recommend an analyst to re-work this SAT in the future in order to ensure the viability of each key assumption. The key assumption that is likely to have the biggest impact on human trafficking in Brazil and thus, my analysis, is “Brazil’s economic status influences human trafficking within its border, as well as, throughout South America”. Since it is early in the economic decline, it is important to monitor this assumption throughout the next year to maintain its relevance and accuracy to the overall analysis.

**Evaluation of NIE:**

The NIE process was a long and thorough one, which is exactly what it should be. From the beginning of the process, way back to brainstorming a topic to write about, I knew I wanted my final NIE draft to be one of value and credibility. The research process I underwent added great credibility to my NIE, which in return, created a higher quality intelligence product. At first, I had a general idea of what direction I wanted to take the NIE; however, I let the evidence and research guide the process. Overall, the NIE proved to be quite essential to my analysis and judgements, particularly for informing the U.S. State Department, which was the customer for the NIE. The NIE was able to better contextualize the issue of human trafficking in a way that addresses the U.S. State Department’s mission.
Through the process of an NIE, I was able to take an incredibly intricate and complex national security threat and analyze it from different angles through the use of key judgements. The Scope Note narrowed the focus of the NIE, which increased the quality of the analysis by centralizing on specific aspects of human trafficking. The Scope Note also proved helpful in producing key questions that the NIE focuses on throughout the product. Along with the Scope Note, the Key Judgements aided in directing the NIE towards an issue of national security.

The point of the NIE in which I began to let the evidence and research drive most of the analysis came in the Key Judgements and Discussion sections. Before this; however, came the Facts and Evidence section. In my evaluation of the NIE, I think this section often gets overlooked in its value added to the overall NIE product. Within this section, I was able to inform my reader about the issue of human trafficking. NIEs are typically written for a generally aware audience; meaning the audience is aware of the issue at a basic level. This section is tasked with providing not only a comprehensive background from multiple angles—whether that be political climate, situational awareness, or historical context—, but also current events that are taking place within the scope of the NIE. Without a detailed Facts and Evidence section, the reader is less likely to fully grasp the analysis in the remaining sections of the NIE.

The evidence and research driven section of this intelligence product is also essential to the overall evaluation of the NIE. At this point in the NIE, it was important to remove any bias or pre-conceived views regarding the topic. I took my research information and transformed it into intelligence. The Discussion section of the NIE ended up being the most impactful section of the NIE. In this section, I analyzed the evidence and facts provided via research in order to refine my
analysis concerning my key judgements. My evaluation of this section is that it completes the NIE and provides the reader the “so what?” aspect of an NIE.

In the end, choosing to write an NIE complimented the purposes of writing this thesis. The NIE enabled me to better contextualize the issue of human trafficking on not only a domestic scale through potential U.S. influences, but also on a global scale via analysis in Brazil. The NIE also provided a template for the required intense analysis and also a platform in which to deliver the analytical findings to policymakers and other customers.
Works Cited


